

# On generic automorphisms of a tree structure

神戸大学大学院システム情報学研究科  
桔梗 宏孝 (Hirotaka Kikyo)

Graduate School of System Informatics, Kobe University

筑波大学大学院数理物質科学研究科  
坪井 明人 (Akito Tsuboi)

Graduate School of Pure and Applied Sciences  
University of Tsukuba

## Abstract

We give a theory  $T$  with the strict order property such that for some automorphism  $\sigma_0$  of a prime model  $M_0$  of  $T$ , the theory

$$T + \text{“}\sigma \text{ is an automorphism”} + \text{“}\sigma|_{M_0} = \sigma_0\text{”}$$

is model complete. Note that  $T + \text{“}\sigma \text{ is an automorphism”}$  has no model companion if  $T$  has the strict order property [3]. This seems to have some resemblance with the theory of the rings of Witt Vectors carrying the Frobenius automorphism [1].

We consider each natural number  $n$  as the set  $\{0, 1, \dots, n-1\}$ . Consider a structure  $(M_0, <)$  with

$$M_0 = \{f : n \rightarrow n+1 \mid n < \omega, f(i) < i+1 \text{ for } i < n\},$$

and  $f < g$  if  $g$  is a proper extension of  $f$  as a map for  $f, g \in M_0$ .

For each  $f \in M_0$  with  $\text{dom } f = n$ , let  $f^s$  be a map such that

$$f^s(i) = (f(i) + 1) \bmod (i + 1)$$

for  $i < n$ . Then the map  $s : M_0 \rightarrow M_0$  defined by  $s(f) = f^s$  is an automorphism of  $(M_0, <)$ .  $\epsilon$  denotes the least element of  $M_0$  (i.e.,  $\epsilon$  is the empty sequence). Let  $<_1$  be a definable relation on  $M_0$  defined by the formula

$$x < y \wedge \forall z \neg(x < z < y).$$

Let  $T_0$  be the theory of  $(M_0, <, <_1)$ . Note that for any model  $M$  of  $T_0$ ,  $\text{acl}_M(\emptyset) = M_0$ . The root (the least element) of  $M_0$  will be denoted by  $\epsilon$ .

**Proposition 1.** *Let  $M$  be a model of  $T_0$ . Then the following sentences are valid in  $M$ :*

- (1)  $\forall x \exists y \quad x <_1 y$ .
- (2)  $\forall x, y \quad x < y \rightarrow \exists z \quad x <_1 z \leq y$ .
- (3)  $\forall x, y \quad x < y \rightarrow \exists z \quad x \leq z <_1 y$ .
- (4)  $\forall x, y, z \quad x, y \leq z \rightarrow x < y \vee x = y \vee y < x$ .
- (5)  $\forall x, y \exists u, v \quad x \not\leq y \rightarrow u <_1 v \leq x \wedge u \leq y \wedge v \not\leq y$ .
- (6) *Let  $n$  be any natural number. If  $x < y$  and  $x$  has (at least)  $n$  childs then  $y$  has (at least)  $n + 1$  childs.*

**Theorem 2.** *The theory*

$$T_0 \cup \{\sigma \text{ is a } <\text{-automorphism extending } s\}$$

*in the language  $\{<, <_1, \sigma\} \cup M_0$  has a model companion. In fact, it is model complete.*

We fix models  $M \subset M'$  of  $T$  and assume that  $\sigma$  is a  $<$ -automorphism of  $M'$  extending  $s$  and  $M$  is  $\sigma$ -invariant.

**Lemma 3.** *If  $a, b \in M$  then  $\inf_M \{a, b\} = \inf_{M'} \{a, b\}$ .*

*Proof.* Let  $c = \inf_M \{a, b\}$ . If  $c = a$  or  $c = b$  then there is nothing to prove.

Suppose  $c < a, b$ . Then we can choose  $c_a, c_b \in M$  such that  $c <_1 c_a \leq a$ ,  $c <_1 c_b \leq b$ , and  $c_a$  is incomparable with  $c_b$ . Now, we show that  $c = \inf_{M'} \{a, b\}$ . Let  $d \in M' - M$  be such that  $d < a, b$ . Then  $d$  is comparable with both  $c_a$  and  $c_b$ . Only the case  $d < c_a, c_b$  is possible. Therefore,  $d < c$ .  $\square$

**Definition 4.** Suppose  $a, b \in M' - M$ . We say that  $a$  and  $b$  are *dependent over  $M$*  if there is  $c \in M' - M$  such that  $c \leq a$  and  $c \leq b$ . We call such  $c$  a *witness* of the dependence.  $a$  and  $b$  are dependent over  $M$  if and only if  $\inf\{a, b\} \in M' - M$ .

We say that  $a$  and  $b$  are *independent over  $M$*  if  $a$  and  $b$  are not dependent over  $M$ .

**Lemma 5.** *The dependence over  $M$  is an equivalence relation on  $M' - M$ .*

*Proof.* The reflexivity and the symmetry are trivial. We show the transitivity. Suppose  $b$  and  $c$  are dependent over  $M$  with a witness  $u$ , and  $c$  and  $d$  are dependent over  $M$  with a witness  $v$ . Since  $u \leq c$  and  $v \leq c$ ,  $u$  and  $v$  are comparable. Without loss of generality, we can assume that  $u \leq v$ . Then  $u \leq v \leq d$ . Therefore,  $b$  and  $d$  are dependent over  $M$  with a witness  $u$ .  $\square$

**Lemma 6.** *If  $b \in M' - M_0$  then  $b$  and  $\sigma^m b$  are independent over  $M_0$  for any integer  $m \neq 0$ .*

*Proof.* Let  $m \neq 0$  be an integer and  $b \in M' - M$ . Choose  $f < b$  such that  $f \in M_0$  and  $\text{dom } f \supset m$ . Then  $f$  and  $s^m f$  are incomparable and also  $s^m f < \sigma^m b$ .

Suppose there is  $a \in M' - M_0$  such that  $a \leq b$  and  $a \leq \sigma^m b$ .  $f$  and  $a$  are comparable by  $f < b$  and  $a \leq b$ . Since  $f$  has a finite distance from the root, we have  $f < a$ . Similarly,  $s^m f < a$ . Therefore,  $f$  and  $s^m f$  are comparable. A contradiction.  $\square$

**Corollary 7.** *If  $a, b \in M' - M$  are dependent over  $M$  then  $a$  and  $\sigma^m b$  are independent over  $M$  for any integer  $m \neq 0$ .*

*Proof.* Suppose  $a, b \in M' - M$  are dependent over  $M$  and  $a$  and  $\sigma^m b$  are dependent over  $M$  for some integer  $m \neq 0$ . Suppose  $c \leq a$ ,  $c \leq b$  with  $c \in M' - M$ , and  $d \leq a$ ,  $d \leq \sigma^m b$  with  $d \in M' - M$ .

Since  $c, d \leq a$ ,  $c$  and  $d$  are comparable. Therefore,  $\min\{c, d\} \leq \inf\{b, \sigma^m b\}$ , and hence  $\inf\{b, \sigma^m b\} \in M' - M$  contradicting Lemma 6.  $\square$

**Definition 8.** Suppose  $a, b \in M' - M$ . We say that  $a$  and  $b$  are *quasi-connected over  $M$*  if there is  $c \in M'$  such that

- (1)  $M' \models c \leq a, b$ ,
- (2)  $M' \models c \leq y \leq a$  implies  $y \in M' - M$ , and
- (3)  $M' \models c \leq y \leq b$  implies  $y \in M' - M$ .

We call  $c$  a *witness* of this property. Note that if  $a$  and  $b$  are quasi-connected over  $M$  then it is dependent over  $M$ .

**Lemma 9.** *The quasi-connectedness over  $M$  is an equivalence relation on  $M' - M$ .*

*Proof.* The reflexivity and the symmetry are trivial. We show the transitivity. Suppose  $b$  and  $c$  are quasi-connected over  $M$  with a witness  $u$  and  $c$  and  $d$  are quasi-connected over  $M$  with a witness  $v$ . Since  $u \leq c$  and  $v \leq c$ ,  $u$  and  $v$  are comparable. Without loss of generality, we can assume that  $u \leq v$ . We show that  $u$  is a witness for quasi-connectedness of  $b$  and  $d$  over  $M$ . If  $u \leq w \leq b$  then  $w \in M' - M$  since  $u$  is a witness for quasi-connectedness of  $b$  and  $c$ .

Suppose  $u \leq w \leq d$ . Then  $w$  and  $v$  are comparable. If  $w \leq v$  then  $u \leq w \leq c$  and thus  $w \in M' - M$ . If  $v < w$  then  $v \leq w \leq d$  and thus  $w \in M' - M$ .  $\square$

**Lemma 10.** *Suppose that  $B$  is a finite subset of  $M' - M$  quasi-connected over  $M$ ,  $a_1, \dots, a_m \in M$  and for each  $a_i$  there is  $b_i \in B$  such that  $b_i < a_i$ . Then there is  $b \in B$  such that  $b < \inf\{a_1, \dots, a_m\}$ .*

*Proof.* Let  $a = \inf\{a_1, \dots, a_m\}$  in  $M$ . Then  $a = \inf\{a_1, \dots, a_m\}$  in  $M'$  by Lemma 3.

Let  $b = \inf B$  in  $M'$ . We have  $b \in M' - M$  because  $B$  is quasi-connected over  $M$ . Since  $b$  is a lower bound for  $\{a_1, \dots, a_m\}$ , we have  $b \leq a$ . Choose  $b_1 \in B$  such that  $b_1 < a_1$ . Then  $b_1$  and  $a$  are comparable. If  $a \leq b_1$  then  $b \leq a \leq b_1$ , but this cannot happen since there is no element  $y \in M$  such that  $b \leq y \leq b_1$ . Therefore,  $b_1 < a$ .  $\square$

**Lemma 11.** (1) Suppose  $M' \models a <_1 b$  with  $a \in M$  and  $b \in M' - M$ . Then there is no  $a' \in M$  such that  $M' \models b < a'$ .

(2) If  $b \in M' - M$  then there is no  $a \in M$  such that  $M' \models b <_1 a$ .

*Proof.* (1) Suppose  $M' \models a <_1 b < a'$  with  $a, a' \in M$  and  $b \in M' - M$ . Then there must be  $a'' \in M$  such that  $M \models a <_1 a'' < a'$ , and thus  $M' \models a <_1 a'' < a'$ . But this cannot happen because  $b \neq a''$ .

(2) Suppose there is  $b \in M' - M$  and  $a \in M$  such that  $M' \models b <_1 a$ . Since  $M' \models \epsilon < a$ , we have  $M \models \epsilon < a$ . Therefore,  $M \models a' <_1 a$  for some  $a' \in M$  and thus  $M' \models a' <_1 a$ . But this cannot happen because  $b \neq a'$ .  $\square$

**Definition 12.** Suppose  $C$  and  $D$  are subsets of  $M'$ . We write  $C < D$  if there is  $c \in C$  such that  $c \leq d$  for any  $d \in D$ .

**Definition 13.** A finite subset  $X$  of  $M' - M$  is called *canonical* if the following conditions are satisfied:

- (1) For any  $x, y \in X$ , whenever  $x$  and  $\sigma^m(y)$  with  $m \in \mathbb{Z}$  are dependent over  $M$  then  $m = 0$ ;
- (2) if  $x, y \in X$  are dependent over  $M$  then there is  $z \in X$  witnessing the dependence; and
- (3) if  $x, y \in X$  are quasi-connected over  $M$  then there is  $z \in X$  witnessing the quasi-connectedness.

**Definition 14.** Let  $B$  be a subset of  $M'$ .  $\langle B \rangle_\sigma$  denotes the set  $\{\sigma^m(b) \mid b \in B, m \in \mathbb{Z}\}$ .

**Lemma 15.** For any finite subset  $X \subset M' - M$  there is a canonical subset  $Z \subset M' - M$  such that  $X \subset \langle Z \rangle_\sigma$ .

*Proof.* We prove the statement by induction on the number of elements in  $X$ . It is trivial if  $|X| = 0$ . Suppose  $X = \{a\} \cup X'$  with  $|X'| < |X|$ . By the induction hypothesis, there is a canonical subset  $Y'$  of  $M' - M$  such that  $X' \subset \langle Y' \rangle_\sigma$ .

We split the proof into the following cases.

Case 1.  $\sigma^m a$  and  $b$  are quasi-connected over  $M$  for some  $b \in Y'$  and an integer  $m$ .

Let  $b_0$  be the least element in  $Y'$  which is quasi-connected to  $\sigma^m a$  over  $M$ . Let  $c = \inf\{\sigma^m a, b_0\}$ . We claim that  $Y = Y' \cup \{\sigma^m a, c\}$  is canonical and has the desired property.

Let  $C_{b_0}$  be the quasi-connected component of  $Y$  containing  $b_0$  and  $D_{b_0}$  be the dependent component of  $Y$  containing  $b_0$ . It is easy to see that  $\{c\} \cup C_{b_0}$  is a tree.  $\{c\} \cup D_{b_0}$  is also a tree. Let  $d$  be the least element of  $D_{b_0}$ . Since  $c \leq b_0$  and  $d \leq b_0$ ,  $c$  and  $d$  are comparable. Therefore,  $\{c\} \cup D_{b_0}$  is a tree.

Now, suppose that  $\sigma^{m+l}a$  and  $b \in Y'$  are dependent over  $M$ . Then  $\sigma^l b_0$  and  $\sigma^{m+l}a$  are dependent over  $M$  and thus  $\sigma^l b_0$  and  $b \in Y'$  are dependent over  $M$ . Since  $Y'$  is canonical, we have  $l = 0$ .

Case 2. Case 1 does not hold but  $\sigma^m a$  and  $b$  are dependent over  $M$  for some  $b \in Y'$  and an integer  $m$ .

Let  $b_0$  be the least element in  $Y'$  which is dependent to  $\sigma^m a$  over  $M$ . Choose a witness  $c \in M' - M$  of dependence of  $b_0$  and  $\sigma^m a$ .  $Y = Y' \cup \{\sigma^m a, c\}$  is canonical and has the desired property. The argument is the same as that for Case 1.

Case 3. There is no integer  $m$  and  $b \in Y'$  such that  $\sigma^m a$  and  $b$  are dependent over  $M$ . In this case,  $Y = Y' \cup \{a\}$  is canonical and has the desired property.  $\square$

**Lemma 16.** *Suppose  $\{t_1, \dots, t_n\} \subset M' - M$  is canonical. Then any formula in  $\text{qftp}_{\{<, \sigma\}}(t_1, \dots, t_n/M)$  is realised in  $M$ .*

*Proof.* Suppose  $\{t_1, \dots, t_n\} \subset M' - M$  is canonical. Let  $t$  be the tuple  $(t_1, \dots, t_n)$  and  $\varphi(x)$  a formula with  $x = (x_1, \dots, x_n)$  belonging to  $\text{qftp}_{\{<, <_1, \sigma\}}(t/M)$ . Let  $N$  be a natural number such that if  $\sigma^m(x_i)$  occurs in  $\varphi(x)$  then  $m \leq N$ . Let  $A$  be a finite subset of  $M$  such that  $\varphi(x)$  is over  $A$ .

By adding finitely many points of  $M$  to  $A$  if necessary, we can assume the following:

- If  $C$  is a quasi-connected component of  $t$  then  $\{a\} < C$  for some  $a \in A$ ;
- if  $C$  and  $C'$  are two quasi-connected components of  $t$  with  $C < C'$  then there is  $a \in A$  such that  $C < \{a\} < C'$ ;
- if  $C$  is a quasi-connected component of  $t$  and there is  $a \in M$  and  $c \in M' - M$  quasi-connected to  $C$  over  $M$  such that  $a <_1 c$  then  $a \in A$  and  $c \in C$ ;
- if  $C$  is a quasi-connected component of  $t$  such that  $\{a \in A \mid C < \{a\}\}$  is non-empty then  $\inf\{a \in A \mid C < \{a\}\} \in A$ ;
- if  $a \in A$  is comparable with  $t_i$  for some  $i$  then  $\sigma^m(a) \in A$  for  $m \leq N$ ; and
- if  $a \in A$  is comparable with  $\sigma^m(t_i)$  for some  $i$  and a natural number  $m \leq N$  then  $\sigma^{-m}(a) \in A$ .

We can assume that  $t = C_1 \hat{\ } \dots \hat{\ } C_l$  where each  $C_i$  is an enumeration of a quasi-connected component of  $t$ .

Let  $a_i$  be the maximum element in  $A$  such that  $\{a_i\} < C_i$  and  $b_i$  be the minimum element in  $A$  such that  $C_i < \{b_i\}$ . Such  $a_i$  exists by the assumption on  $A$  and such  $b_i$  exists if there is  $b \in A$  such that  $C_i < \{b\}$  by Lemma 10 and the assumption on  $A$ .

Suppose that there are infinitely many elements  $d$  of  $M$  connected to  $a_i$  such that  $a_i < d < C_i$ . Choose  $a'_i \in M$  connected to  $a_i$  with the following properties:

- If  $x \in A$  and  $M \models \sigma^m b_i \not\leq x$  with  $0 \leq m \leq N$  then  $M \models \sigma^m a_i \not\leq x$ ; and
- if  $C'$  is a quasi-connected component of  $t$  such that  $C_i \not\leq C'$  then  $\{a'_i\} \not\leq C'$ .

In the case that  $b_i$  exists, choose a tuple  $C'_i$  from  $M$  such that  $\text{qftp}_{\{<, <_1\}}(C_i/a'_i, b_i) = \text{qftp}_{\{<, <_1\}}(C'_i/a'_i, b_i)$ . Then we have  $\text{qftp}_{\{<, <_1\}}(\sigma^m C_i/A) = \text{qftp}_{\{<, <_1\}}(\sigma^m C'_i/A)$  for  $m = 0, 1, \dots, N$ .

In the case that there is no such  $b_i$  for  $C_i$ , choose a tuple  $C'_i$  from  $M$  such that  $\text{qftp}_{\{<, <_1\}}(C_i/a'_i) = \text{qftp}_{\{<, <_1\}}(C'_i/a'_i)$ . Then we have  $\text{qftp}_{\{<, <_1\}}(\sigma^m C_i/A) = \text{qftp}_{\{<, <_1\}}(\sigma^m C'_i/A)$  for  $m = 0, 1, \dots, N$ .

Suppose  $C_{i_1}, \dots, C_{i_k}$  are quasi-connected and  $a <_1 \inf C_{i_j}$  for  $j = 1, \dots, k$ . In this case, there is no  $x \in A$  such that  $C_{i_j} < \{x\}$  by Lemma 11. We can choose  $c'_{i_j} \in M - A$  for  $j = 1, \dots, k$  which are pairwise distinct such that  $M \models a_i <_1 c'_{i_j}$  and  $M \models \sigma^m c'_{i_j} \not\leq x$  for  $x \in A$  and  $m$  with  $0 \leq m \leq N$ . Choose a tuple  $C'_{i_j}$  for  $j = 1, \dots, k$  from  $M$  such that  $\text{qftp}_{\{<, <_1\}}(C_{i_j}, \inf C_{i_j}) = \text{qftp}_{\{<, <_1\}}(C'_{i_j}, c'_{i_j})$ . Then  $\text{qftp}_{\{<, <_1\}}(C_{i_j}/A) = \text{qftp}_{\{<, <_1\}}(C'_{i_j}/A)$ .

Let  $t' = C'_1 \hat{\ } \dots \hat{\ } C'_l$ .

**Claim 1.**  $\text{qftp}_{\{<, <_1\}}(t \hat{\ } \sigma t \hat{\ } \sigma^2 t \hat{\ } \dots \hat{\ } \sigma^N t/A) = \text{qftp}_{\{<, <_1\}}(t' \hat{\ } \sigma t' \hat{\ } \sigma^2 t' \hat{\ } \dots \hat{\ } \sigma^N t'/A)$

□

*Proof of Theorem 2.* We show that  $(M, <, \sigma|M)$  is existentially closed in  $(M', <, \sigma)$ . Choose a finite tuple  $(t_1, \dots, t_n)$  from  $M' - M$  and let  $\varphi(x_1, \dots, x_n)$  be a quantifier-free formula of  $\{<, \sigma\} \cup M$  realised by  $(t_1, \dots, t_n)$ . By Lemma 15, we can choose  $t'_1, \dots, t'_n \in M' - M$  such that  $t_i = \sigma^{k_i}(t'_i)$  for each  $i$  with some  $k_i \geq 0$  and the set  $\{t'_1, \dots, t'_n\}$  is canonical. We have

$$M' \models \varphi(\sigma^{k_1}(t'_1), \dots, \sigma^{k_n}(t'_n)).$$

By Lemma 16, we can choose  $t''_1, \dots, t''_n \in M$  such that

$$M \models \varphi(\sigma^{k_1}(t''_1), \dots, \sigma^{k_n}(t''_n)).$$

Therefore,  $\varphi(x_1, \dots, x_n)$  is realised in  $M$ .

□

## References

- [1] Luc Bélair, Angus Macintyre, and Thomas Scanlon, Model theory of the Frobenius on the Witt vectors, *American Journal of Mathematics*, vol. **129** (2007), 665–721.
- [2] Hirotaka Kikyo, Model companions of theories with an automorphism, *Journal of Symbolic Logic*, vol. **65**, No. 3 (2000), 1215–1222.
- [3] Hirotaka Kikyo and Saharon Shelah, The strict order property and generic automorphisms, *Journal of Symbolic Logic*, vol. **67**, No. 1 (2002), 124–126.