

# On the speed of hereditary properties of graphs

Kota Takeuchi  
University of Tsukuba

## Abstract

We give a short proof of C. Terry's result[3] on the jump to the fastest speed of hereditary properties.

## 1 Introduction and Preliminaries

Let  $L$  be a finite relational language. A hereditary  $L$ -property is a hereditary class  $H$  of finite  $L$ -structures which is closed under isomorphism. The universe of an  $L$ -structure  $A$  is denoted by  $\|A\|$ . Let  $[n]$  be the  $n$ -point set  $\{0, 1, \dots, n-1\}$ . For each  $n \in \omega$ , let  $H_n = \{A \in H : \|A\| = [n]\}$ . The speed of  $H$  is the function  $n \mapsto |H_n|$ . C. Terry proved that there is a gap on the speed and it is characterized by a kind of VC-dimension of  $H$ , as follows.

**Theorem 1** (Terry[3]). Suppose  $L$  is a finite relational language of maximum arity  $r \geq 2$ , and  $H$  is a hereditary  $L$ -property. Then either

1.  $VC_{r-1}^*(H) < \infty$  and there is an  $\epsilon > 0$  such that for sufficiently large  $n$ ,  $|H_n| \leq 2^{n^{r-\epsilon}}$ , or
2.  $VC_{r-1}^*(H) = \infty$  and there is a constant  $C > 0$  such that  $|H_n| = 2^{Cn^r + o(n^r)}$ .

This kind of result was well known for graph properties, i.e. for classes of graphs(for example, see introduction of [3], or Theorem 2 in [1]). Terry's work gives a generalization of them to the cases of hyper (not simple, not undirected) graphs. One of the main technique in her proof is  $VC^*$ -dimension introduced in her paper and a kind of Sauer-Shelah's lemma for product sets proved by Chernikov, Palacin and the author[2]. Note that Terry's result is

about the cases of  $r \geq 1$ , however,  $r = 1$  case is immediate (by the original Sauer-Shelah's lemma), hence we discuss only on the cases of  $r \geq 2$  here.

In this article, we will give a simple proof of the theorem. In fact, it is almost directly proven from the generalized Sauer-Shelah's lemma with some model theoretic trick.

In the rest of this section, we recall some basic definitions and facts on  $VC_r$ -dimension and hereditary properties. One can also check [2] for the details of  $VC_r$ -dimension and the generalized Sauer-Shelah's lemma.

**Definition 2.** Let  $r \in \omega$  and  $\mathcal{C} \subset \mathcal{P}(\omega^r)$ .

1. For  $A \subset \omega^r$ ,  $\mathcal{C}|A = \{A \cap B : B \in \mathcal{C}\}$ .
2.  $A \subset \omega^r$  is said to be shattered if  $\mathcal{C}|A = \mathcal{P}(A)$ .
3. A subset  $A \subset \omega^r$  is called a box of size  $d$  if  $A = A_0 \times \dots \times A_{r-1}$  and  $|A_i| = d$  for all  $i < r$ .
4. The  $VC_r$ -dimension  $VC_r(\mathcal{C})$  of  $\mathcal{C}$  is the maximum natural number  $d$  such that there is a box  $A \subset \omega^r$  of size  $d$  such that  $A$  is shattered by  $\mathcal{C}$ .
5. The shatter function  $\pi_{\mathcal{C}}$  is the function  $\omega \rightarrow \omega$  such that  $\pi_{\mathcal{C}}(n) = \max\{|\mathcal{C}|A| : A \subset \omega^r \text{ is a box of size } n\}$ .

The following fact is a generalization of Sauer-Shelah's lemma.

**Fact 3** (Chernikov, Palacin, and T.). Let  $\mathcal{C} \subset \mathcal{P}(\omega^r)$ . Then either

1.  $VC_r(\mathcal{C}) = \infty$  and  $\pi_{\mathcal{C}}(n) = 2^{n^r}$  for every  $n$ , or
2.  $VC_r(\mathcal{C}) = d < \infty$  and there is  $\epsilon > 0$  such that  $\pi_{\mathcal{C}}(n) < 2^{n^{r-\epsilon}}$  for sufficiently large  $n$ . Here,  $\epsilon$  depends only on  $d$  and  $r$ .

Note that  $\epsilon$  in the above fact was explicitly given in [2].

Next we define  $VC_r$ -dimension for hereditary  $L$ -properties. Suppose that  $L$  is a finite relational language of maximum arity  $r \geq 2$ .

**Definition 4.** Let  $H$  be a class of finite  $L$ -structures.

1.  $H$  is said to be hereditary if  $A \in H$  and  $B \subset A$  then  $B \in H$ . (Here  $B \subset A$  means that  $B$  is a substructure, in other words induced subgraph, of  $A$ .)
2.  $H$  is said to be hereditary  $L$ -property if  $H$  is a hereditary class which is closed under isomorphism.

3.  $H^c$  is the class of finite  $L$ -structures which is not in  $H$ .
4.  $Th(H) = \{\forall x_1, \dots, x_n (x_1 \dots x_n \not\cong B) : B \in H^c, n \in \omega\}$ .

Notice that  $Th(H)$  is a set of first order  $L$ -sentences and for any finite  $L$ -structure  $A$ ,  $A$  satisfies  $Th(H)$  if and only if  $A \in H$ . To see this, suppose  $A \in H$ . If  $A$  contains a substructure  $B \in H^c$ , then  $B$  must be in  $H$  since  $H$  is hereditary, which implies a contradiction. Hence every substructure of  $A$  cannot be in  $H^c$ . The converse is immediate.

**Remark 5.** Let  $A$  be a finite  $L$ -structure. If there is infinite  $M \models Th(H)$  with  $A \subset M$  then  $A \in H$ . However, the converse is not always true. For example, let  $H$  be the class of every finite graph  $G$  such that if  $|G| > 2$  then  $G$  has no edge. In this case  $K_2 \in H$  but there is no infinite  $M \models Th(H)$  containing  $K_2$ .

**Remark 6.** Let  $T$  be an  $L$ -theory and  $\varphi(x_0, \dots, x_r)$  be an  $L$ -formula. It is known that the following are equivalent:

1. There is an infinite model  $M \models T$  such that  $\mathcal{C}_\varphi = \{\varphi(a, M^r) : a \in M\}$  has  $VC_r$ -dimension  $\infty$ .
2.  $\varphi$  has Independent Property(IP).
3. There is an infinite model  $M \models T$  and  $A_i \subset M$  ( $i < r$ ) such that  $(A_0, \dots, A_{r-1}; \varphi)$  is isomorphic to the  $r$ -partite random  $r$ -hypergraph.

**Definition 7.** We define the  $VC_r$ -dimension  $d$  of an  $(r + 1)$ -ary formula  $\varphi(x_0, \dots, x_r)$  by the  $VC_r$ -dimension of  $\mathcal{C}_\varphi$  in Remark 6. Hence  $\varphi(x_0, \dots, x_r)$  has infinite  $VC_r$ -dimension if and only if one of the conditions in Remark 6 holds.

It is easy to see that if a formula  $\varphi(x_0, \dots, x_r)$  is given by adding dummy variables to a formula  $\psi(x_0, \dots, x_k)$  with  $k < r$ , then  $\varphi$  has finite  $VC_r$ -dimension. It is also known that if  $\varphi$  is given as a boolean combination of formulas with finite  $VC_r$ -dimension, then  $\varphi$  also has finite  $VC_r$ -dimension.

## 2 A proof of the main theorem

In this section, we give a proof of the following:

**Theorem 8.** Let  $L$  be a finite relational language with maximum arity  $r$ . Let  $H$  be a hereditary  $L$ -property. Then either

1. Every relation  $R \in L$  has finite  $\text{VC}_{r-1}$ -dimension in  $\text{Th}(H)$  and there is  $\epsilon > 0$  such that  $|H_n| < 2^{n^{r-\epsilon}}$  for sufficiently large  $n$ .
2. Some relation  $R \in L$  has infinite  $\text{VC}_{r-1}$ -dimension in  $\text{Th}(H)$  and there is a constant  $C > 0$  such that  $|H_n| \geq 2^{n^{Cr}}$  for every  $n$ .

Moreover,  $\epsilon$  depends only on  $r$  and the maximum number  $d$  of  $\text{VC}_{r-1}$ -dimensions of  $R \in L$

Before starting the proof, we need some definitions.

**Definition 9.** Let  $H$  be a hereditary  $L$ -property.

1. Let  $R \in L$  and  $A \in H$ . An restricted structure  $A|R$  is the  $\{R\}$ -structure which is obtained by forgetting other relations on  $A$ .
2.  $H|R = \{A|R : A \in H\}$ .
3. For each  $R \in L$  with arity  $r$ , we put  $\mathcal{C}(R) = \{f(R) \subset \omega^r : f : M \rightarrow \omega \text{ is an injection, } M \models \text{Th}(H)\}$ , where  $f(R) = \{(f(a_0), \dots, f(a_{r-1})) : R(a_0, \dots, a_{r-1}) \text{ holds}\}$ .

**Remark 10.** Let  $H$  be a hereditary  $L$ -property and  $L = \{R_0, \dots, R_{k-1}\}$ . The following are easy to check.

1. If  $L = \{R\}$ , then  $|H_n| = |\mathcal{C}(R)|[n]^r \leq \pi_{\mathcal{C}(R)}(n)$ .
2.  $|(H|R_0)_n| \leq |H_n| \leq |(H|R_0)_n| \times \dots \times |(H|R_{k-1})_n|$ .

Now we prove the main theorem.

*Proof.* Suppose that  $R \in L$  has infinite  $\text{VC}_{r-1}$ -dimension. By Remark 6 and the subsequent discussion, we can assume

- $R$  is  $r$ -ary relation,
- there is  $M \models \text{Th}(H)$  and  $A_i \subset M$  ( $i < r$ ) such that  $(A_0, \dots, A_{r-1}; R)$  is isomorphic to the  $r$ -partite random  $r$ -hypergraph.

We show that for any  $n$ ,  $|H_n| \geq 2^{m^r}$  where  $\frac{n}{r} \geq m \in \omega$ . Suppose  $rm \leq n$ . By the second item of Remark 10, we can assume  $L = \{R\}$ . Let  $X = X_0 \sqcup \dots \sqcup X_{r-1}$  be a set of ( $r$ -partite) vertices such that  $|X_i| = m$  for all  $i < r$ . The number of  $r$ -partite  $r$ -uniform hypergraph on  $X$  is  $2^{m^r}$ , since edges  $R$  is determined as a subset of  $\Pi_i X_i$ . Since every  $r$ -partite  $r$ -uniform hypergraph  $(X, R)$  can be embeddable into the  $r$ -partite random  $r$ -hypergraph,  $(X, R) \models \text{Th}(H)$ . Hence  $n \geq rm = |X|$  implies that  $|H_n| \geq 2^{m^r}$ .

Conversely, suppose that every  $R \in L$  has finite  $\text{VC}_{r-1}$ -dimension  $\leq d$  (if it is needed, by adding dummy variable). We'll show that there is  $\epsilon = \epsilon(r, d) > 0$  such that  $|H_n| \leq 2^{n^{r-\epsilon}}$  for sufficiently large  $n$ . Again by Remark 10, we can assume  $L = \{R(x_0, \dots, x_{r-1})\}$  and  $|H_n| = \pi_{\mathcal{C}(R)}(n)$ . Suppose that there is no  $\epsilon > 0$  such that  $\pi_{\mathcal{C}(R)}(n) \geq 2^{n^{r-\epsilon}}$  for sufficiently large  $n$ . Then by Fact 3,  $\mathcal{C}(R)$  must have infinite  $\text{VC}_r$ -dimension and hence for every  $n$  there is a box  $A_0 \times \dots \times A_{r-1} \subset \omega^r$  of size  $n$  which is shattered by  $\mathcal{C}(R)$ . This means, by the definition of  $\mathcal{C}(R)$ , (by adding edges on each part if necessary) every  $r$ -partite  $r$ -uniform hypergraph satisfies  $Th(H)$ . By the compactness theorem, there is  $M \models Th(H)$  and  $A_i \subset M$  ( $i < r$ ) such that  $(A_0, \dots, A_{r-1}; R)$  is isomorphic to the  $r$ -partite random  $r$ -hypergraph. This contradicts to the finiteness of  $\text{VC}_{r-1}$ -dimension of  $R$ .  $\square$

## References

- [1] Alon, Noga, József Balogh, Béla Bollobás, and Robert Morris. "The structure of almost all graphs in a hereditary property." *Journal of Combinatorial Theory, Series B* 101, no. 2 (2011): 85-110.
- [2] Chernikov, Artem, Daniel Palacin, and Kota Takeuchi. "On  $n$ -dependence." arXiv preprint arXiv:1411.0120 (2014). To appear in *Notre Dame Journal of Formal Logic*.
- [3] Terry, C. "VC $_l$ -dimension and the jump to the fastest speed of a hereditary  $L$ -property." *Proceedings of the American Mathematical Society* (2018).