# THE VALUATIVE CAPACITIES OF THE SETS OF SUMS OF TWO AND OF THREE SQUARES 

Youssef Fares<br>Laboratoire de mathématiques fondamentales et appliquées d'Amiens, CNRS UMR 6140, 33 Rue Saint Leu, 80039 Amiens (France)<br>youssef.fares@u-picardie.fr<br>Keith Johnson<br>Department of Mathematics, Dalhousie University, Halifax, Nova Scotia, B3H 4R2, Canada<br>johnson@mathstat.dal.ca

Received: 8/31/14, Revised: 5/12/16, Accepted: 6/6/16, Published: 7/7/16


#### Abstract

If $A$ is a subset of $\mathbb{Z}$, then the $n$-th characteristic ideal of $A$ is the fractional ideal of $\mathbb{Z}$ consisting of 0 and the leading coefficients of polynomials in $\mathbb{Q}[x]$ of degree no more than $n$ which are integer-valued on $A$. The valuative capacity with respect to a prime $p$ of $A$ is a measure of the rate of growth of the $p$-adic part of these characteristic ideals of $A$ and is defined, for a given $p$, to be the value of the limit $$
\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\alpha_{A, p}(n)}{n}
$$ where $\alpha_{A, p}(n)$ is the $p$-adic valuation of the inverse of the $n$-th characteristic ideal of $A$. In this paper we compute this valuative capacity when $A$ is the set of those integers which are expressible as the sum of two and of three squares.


## 1. Introduction

For any subset $A$ of $\mathbb{Z}$, the ring of integer-valued polynomials on $A$ is defined to be

$$
\operatorname{Int}(A, \mathbb{Z})=\{f(x) \in \mathbb{Q}[x]: f(A) \subseteq \mathbb{Z}\}
$$

Associated with this ring is its sequence of characteristic ideals $\left\{I_{n}: n=0,1,2, \ldots\right\}$, with $I_{n}$ the fractional ideal formed by 0 and the leading coefficients of the elements of $\operatorname{Int}(A, \mathbb{Z})$ of degree at most $n$. For $p$ a prime, the sequence of negatives of the $p$-adic valuations of the ideals $I_{n},\left\{\alpha_{A, p}(n): n=0,1,2, \ldots\right\}$, is called the characteristic sequence of $A$ with respect to $p$. This sequence is super-additive in the sense that
$\alpha_{A, p}(n+m) \geq \alpha_{A, p}(n)+\alpha_{A, p}(m)$ for any nonnegative integers $n$ and $m$, and so the limit

$$
L_{A, p}=\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\alpha_{A, p}(n)}{n}
$$

always exists (by Fekete's lemma) and is called the valuative capacity of $A$ with respect to the prime $p$.

In some cases this limit can be evaluated by knowing a closed form formula for the terms in the characteristic sequence. For example, if $A=\mathbb{Z}$ then, for any prime, $p$, we have $\alpha_{\mathbb{Z}, p}(n)=\nu_{p}(n!)$, the $p$-adic valuation of $n!$, which equals the largest $k$ for which $p^{k}$ divides $n!$. Since this is given by $\nu_{p}(n!)=\sum_{k>0}\left\lfloor n / p^{k}\right\rfloor$, it follows that $L_{\mathbb{Z}, p}=1 /(p-1)$.

In this paper we evaluate this limit for two subsets of $\mathbb{Z}$ familiar from number theory, for which closed form formulas for $\alpha_{A, p}(n)$ are not available. Let $S$ denote the set of integers which are squares and let $E=S+S$ and $F=S+S+S$ denote the sets of integers which are the sums of two and of three squares, respectively. Of course both of the sets $E$ and $F$ have complete classical number theoretic descriptions:

Theorem 1. (Fermat) An integer $z$ is in $E$ if and only if every prime congruent to 3 modulo 4 which occurs in its prime factorization, does so with even exponent.

Theorem 2. (Legendre) An integer $z$ is in $F$ if and only if it is not of the form $4^{a}(8 b+7)$ for any integers $a$ and $b$.

A subset $B \subseteq A \subseteq \mathbb{Z}$ is polynomially dense in $A$ if any rational polynomial that is integer-valued on $B$, is also integer-valued on $A$, and so $\operatorname{Int}(B)=\operatorname{Int}(A)$. There is a corresponding idea for $p$-locally integer-valued polynomials, and an important result is that $p$-adically dense subsets are also $p$-locally polynomially dense, for any prime $p$. Fermat's and Legendre's theorems allow us to describe $E$ and $F$ as $p$ locally polynomially dense subsets of unions of cosets of powers of primes, and so to use the methods for computing $\alpha$ and $L$ that were developed in [4] and [5]. The results are given in the following theorem.

Theorem 3. The valuative capacities of the sets $E$ and $F$ are

$$
\begin{aligned}
& L_{E, p}=\left\{\begin{array}{lll}
\frac{1}{p-1} & \text { if } p \equiv 1 & (\bmod 4), \\
-1+\sqrt{1+\frac{2 p}{(p-1)^{2}}} & \text { if } p \equiv 3 & (\bmod 4), \\
\frac{-1+\sqrt{13}}{2} & \text { if } p=2 .
\end{array}\right. \\
& L_{F, p}= \begin{cases}\frac{1}{p-1} & \text { if } p>2, \\
\frac{-25+3 \sqrt{705}}{52} & \text { if } p=2 .\end{cases}
\end{aligned}
$$

The answer to the corresponding question for $S$ itself follows from the results in [1] (Example 19). For any prime, $p$, the characteristic sequence of $S$ is given by
$\alpha_{S, p}(n)=\nu_{p}((2 n)!/ 2)$ and hence $L_{S, p}=2 /(p-1)$. Since any nonnegative integer is a sum of four squares the answer in that case is, therefore, also known.

## 2. Valuative Capacity of the Set of Sums of Two Squares

We begin this section with two lemmas, which will be used in the following sections.
Lemma 1. For any prime $p$ and integer $c$, the congruence

$$
x^{2}+y^{2} \equiv c \quad(\bmod p)
$$

is solvable.
Proof. If $p=2$, then this is trivial. For $p>2$, consider the sequence consisting of those positive integers that are congruent to 1 modulo 4 and also congruent to $c$ modulo $p$. This is an arithmetic sequence and so, by Dirichlet's theorem, contains a prime $q$. Since $q$ is congruent to 1 modulo 4 , it is a sum of squares, $q=x^{2}+y^{2}$, and so $x^{2}+y^{2} \equiv c(\bmod p)$, as required.

Lemma 2. If $p$ is any odd prime, $c$ is any integer not divisible by $p$, and $k$ is any positive integer, then the congruence

$$
x^{2}+y^{2} \equiv c \quad\left(\bmod p^{k}\right)
$$

is solvable.
Proof. We proceed by induction on $k$, with the case $k=1$ being the previous lemma. Assume that we have found $\left(x_{k}, y_{k}\right)$ such that

$$
x_{k}^{2}+y_{k}^{2} \equiv c \quad\left(\bmod p^{k}\right)
$$

and consider the following expansion:

$$
\left(x_{k}+a p^{k}\right)^{2}+\left(y_{k}+b p^{k}\right)^{2}=\left(x_{k}^{2}+y_{k}^{2}\right)+2 p^{k}\left(a x_{k}+b y_{k}\right)+p^{2 k}\left(a^{2}+b^{2}\right) .
$$

We wish to solve the congruence

$$
2 p^{k}\left(a x_{k}+b y_{k}\right) \equiv\left(x_{k}^{2}+y_{k}^{2}\right)-c \quad\left(\bmod p^{k+1}\right)
$$

for integers $a$ and $b$. Since $c \not \equiv 0(\bmod p)$, one of $x_{k}$ or $y_{k}$ is not divisible by $p$. Thus the congruence

$$
2\left(a x_{k}+b y_{k}\right) \equiv \frac{c-\left(x_{k}^{2}+y_{k}^{2}\right)}{p^{k}} \quad(\bmod p)
$$

is solvable for $a$ and $b$. Taking $x_{k+1}=x_{k}+a p^{k}$ and $y_{k+1}=y_{k}+b p^{k}$ completes the induction.

### 2.1. The Case $p \equiv 1(\bmod 4)$

Proposition 1. If $p$ is a prime congruent to 1 modulo 4 , $c$ is any integer, and $k$ is any positive integer, then the congruence

$$
x^{2}+y^{2} \equiv c \quad\left(\bmod p^{k}\right)
$$

is solvable.
Proof. If $c$ is not divisible by $p$, then this is the previous lemma; so we restrict our attention to the case $c \equiv 0(\bmod p)$. Since $p \equiv 1(\bmod 4)$, there exists an integer $d$ for which $d^{2} \equiv-1(\bmod p)$. It follows that $x_{1}=d$ and $y_{1}=1$ gives a solution of

$$
x^{2}+y^{2} \equiv c \quad\left(\bmod p^{k}\right)
$$

for $k=1$. Since neither $x_{1}$ nor $y_{1}$ is divisible by $p$, the inductive proof in the previous lemma applies to show that this congruence is solvable for all positive $k$.

Corollary 1. If p is a prime congruent to 1 modulo 4, and if $k$ is a positive integer, then

$$
E /\left(p^{k}\right)=\mathbb{Z} /\left(p^{k}\right)
$$

and so $E$ is p-adically dense in $\mathbb{Z}$.
Recall, from [2, p. 30] for example, that the characteristic sequence of $\mathbb{Z}$ is given by Legendre's formula

$$
\alpha_{\mathbb{Z}, p}(n)=\sum_{k \geq 1}\left\lfloor\frac{n}{p^{k}}\right\rfloor=\frac{n-\sum_{i=0}^{m} n_{i}}{p-1}
$$

if $n=\sum_{i=0}^{m} n_{i} p^{i}$ is the expansion of $n$ in base $p$. We thus have the following result:
Corollary 2. If $p$ is a prime congruent to 1 modulo 4, then the characteristic sequence, $\left\{\alpha_{E, p}(n): n=0,1,2, \ldots\right\}$, of $E$ with respect to $p$ is equal to $\alpha_{\mathbb{Z}, p}(n)$, and so the valuative capacity of $E$ with respect to $p$ is given by

$$
L_{E, p}=\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\alpha_{E, p}(n)}{n}=\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\alpha_{\mathbb{Z}, p}(n)}{n}=\frac{1}{p-1}
$$

2.2. The case $p \equiv 3(\bmod 4)$

We begin with the following notation. If $p$ is a prime congruent to 3 modulo 4 , then let $E_{0}=E \cap(\mathbb{Z} \backslash p \mathbb{Z})$; for $k>0$, let $E_{k}=p^{2 k} E_{0}$.

Lemma 3. If $p$ is a prime congruent to 3 modulo 4, then for any positive integer $k$,

$$
E_{0} /\left(p^{k}\right)=(\mathbb{Z} \backslash p \mathbb{Z}) /\left(p^{k}\right)
$$

and

$$
E=\bigcup_{k \geq 0} E_{k} .
$$

Proof. By Lemma 2, if $c$ is not divisible by $p$, then $x^{2}+y^{2} \equiv c\left(\bmod p^{k}\right)$ is solvable, and hence $(\mathbb{Z} \backslash p \mathbb{Z}) /\left(p^{k}\right) \subseteq E_{0} /\left(p^{k}\right)$. The reverse inclusion is immediate from the definition of $E_{0}$, and so the first equality follows. From Theorem 1 , if $c \in E$, then $\nu_{p}(c)$ is even, and so we have $c=p^{2 k} c^{\prime}$ with $c^{\prime} \in \mathbb{Z} \backslash p \mathbb{Z}$ and, again by Theorem 1 , $c^{\prime} \in E$. Thus $c \in p^{2 k} E_{0}=E_{k}$. Since Theorem 1 also implies $E_{k}=p^{2 k} E_{0} \subset E$, the second equality follows.

To make use of this to evaluate $L_{E, p}$, we recall the following results from [4] and [5]:

Proposition 2. Let p be a fixed prime.

1. If $A \subseteq \mathbb{Z}$ with characteristic sequence $\alpha_{A, p}(n)$, then for any $c \in \mathbb{Z}$ the characteristic sequence of $A+c$ is also $\alpha_{A, p}(n)$, and the characteristic sequence of $p^{k} A$ is $\alpha_{A, p}(n)+k n$.
2. If $B \subseteq \mathbb{Z}$ is another subset of $\mathbb{Z}$ with the property that for any $x \in A$ and $y \in B$ we have $\nu_{p}(x-y)=0$, then the characteristic sequence of $A \cup B$ is the disjoint union of the sequences $\alpha_{A, p}(n)$ and $\alpha_{B, p}(n)$ sorted into nondecreasing order. This sequence is called the shuffle product of $\alpha_{A, p}(n)$ and $\alpha_{B, p}(n)$, and is denoted $\left(\alpha_{A, p} \wedge \alpha_{B, p}\right)(n)$.

The effect that a union of the sort considered in (ii) above has on valuative capacity is determined by the following algebraic result from [5]:

Proposition 3. If $\alpha_{1}(n)$ and $\alpha_{2}(n)$ are superadditive sequences with $L_{1}=\lim \alpha_{1}(n) / n$ and $L_{2}=\lim \alpha_{2}(n) / n$ then,

$$
\lim \frac{\left(\alpha_{1} \wedge \alpha_{2}\right)(n)}{n}=\frac{1}{\frac{1}{L_{1}}+\frac{1}{L_{2}}} .
$$

With these results we can prove:
Proposition 4. If $p$ is a prime congruent to 3 modulo 4 , then

$$
L_{E_{0}, p}=\frac{p}{(p-1)^{2}} .
$$

Proof. The first equality in Lemma 3 shows that $E_{0}$ is $p$-adically, and so polynomially, dense in $\mathbb{Z} \backslash p \mathbb{Z}$. Therefore, these sets have the same characteristic sequence and the same valuative capacity. The set $\mathbb{Z} \backslash p \mathbb{Z}$ is the union of $p-1$ distinct cosets of $p \mathbb{Z}$, each of which has, by Proposition 2(i), characteristic sequence $\alpha_{\mathbb{Z}, p}(n)+n$, and so valuative capacity $L_{\mathbb{Z}, p}+1=p /(p-1)$. Proposition 2 (ii) applies to this union; hence, by Proposition 3 , the valuative capacity of $\mathbb{Z} \backslash p \mathbb{Z}$, and that of $E_{0}$ are given by

$$
L_{E_{0}, p}=L_{\mathbb{Z} \backslash p \mathbb{Z}, p}=\frac{1}{(p-1) \frac{1}{\left(\frac{p}{p-1}\right)}}=\frac{p}{(p-1)^{2}}
$$

Proposition 5. If $p$ is a prime congruent to 3 modulo 4 , then

$$
L_{E, p}=-1+\sqrt{1+\frac{2 p}{(p-1)^{2}}}
$$

Proof. From Lemma 3 we have

$$
E=\bigcup_{k \geq 0} E_{k}=E_{0} \cup\left(\bigcup_{k \geq 1} E_{k}\right)=E_{0} \cup\left(\bigcup_{k \geq 0} p^{2} E_{k}\right)=E_{0} \cup p^{2} E .
$$

Also, if $x \in E_{0}$ and $y \in p^{2} E$, then $\nu_{p}(x-y)=0$. It therefore follows from Proposition 2 that, if ( $k n$ ) denotes the linear sequence whose $n$-th term is $k n$, then the characteristic sequence of $E$ with respect to $p$ satisfies the equation

$$
\alpha_{E, p}=\alpha_{E_{0}, p} \wedge\left(\alpha_{E, p}+(2 n)\right)
$$

This implies, by Proposition 3, that

$$
L_{E, p}=\frac{1}{\frac{1}{L_{E_{0}, p}}+\frac{1}{L_{E, p}+2}}
$$

Solving this for $L_{E, p}$ yields the stated result.

### 2.3. The Case $p=2$

As in the case of odd primes, we will determine the valuative capacity of $E$ for the prime 2 by showing that the 2 -adic closure of $E$ is a union of cosets modulo powers of 2 ; Propositions 2 and 3 can then be applied.

Lemma 4. If $z$ is an element of $E$, then $z \not \equiv 2^{k-2} 3\left(\bmod 2^{k}\right)$ for any integer $k>1$.

Proof. Since $z \in E$, by Theorem 1 its prime expansion is of the form

$$
z=2^{a} \prod_{p_{i} \equiv 1} p_{(\bmod 4)}^{e_{i}} \prod_{q_{i} \equiv 3} q_{(\bmod 4)}^{2 f_{i}} .
$$

Since $q_{i}^{2} \equiv 1(\bmod 4)$, it follows that $z \equiv 2^{a}\left(\bmod 2^{a+2}\right)$.
Lemma 5. If $c$ is congruent to $2^{\ell}$ modulo $2^{\ell+2}$ for some $\ell \geq 0$, then the congruence

$$
x^{2}+y^{2} \equiv c \quad\left(\bmod 2^{k}\right)
$$

is solvable, for every $k \geq 0$.
Proof. The proof, as before, is by induction on $k$. For $k \leq \ell+2$ there is nothing to prove. Since $c \equiv 2^{\ell}\left(\bmod 2^{\ell+2}\right)$, we may write $c=2^{\ell}+d 2^{\ell+2}$. Choose $\left(x_{\ell+3}, y_{\ell+3}\right)$ as follows:

If $\ell$ is even, then

$$
\left(x_{\ell+3}, y_{\ell+3}\right)= \begin{cases}\left(2^{\ell / 2}, 0\right) & \text { if } d \text { is even } \\ \left(2^{\ell / 2}, 2^{\ell / 2+1}\right) & \text { if } d \text { is odd }\end{cases}
$$

while if $\ell$ is odd, then

$$
\left(x_{\ell+3}, y_{\ell+3}\right)= \begin{cases}\left(2^{(\ell-1) / 2}, 2^{(\ell-1) / 2}\right) & \text { if } d \text { is even } \\ \left(2^{(\ell-1) / 2}, 2^{(\ell-1) / 2}+2^{(\ell+1) / 2}\right) & \text { if } d \text { is odd }\end{cases}
$$

Direct calculation shows that these satisfy the required congruence.
We now assume, by induction, that the pair $\left(x_{k}, y_{k}\right)$ has been found for some $k \geq \ell+3$ and proceed to construct $\left(x_{k+1}, y_{k+1}\right)$. We divide the proof into two cases according to the parity of $\ell$, and begin by assuming $\ell$ is even. Also assume, as part of the induction hypothesis, that $\nu_{2}\left(x_{k}\right)=\ell / 2$, and that $\nu_{2}\left(y_{k}\right)>\ell / 2$. Expanding $\left(x_{k}+a 2^{k-\ell / 2-1}\right)^{2}+\left(y_{k}+b 2^{k-\ell / 2-1}\right)^{2}$, we obtain

$$
\left(x_{k}^{2}+y_{k}^{2}\right)+2^{k-\ell / 2}\left(a x_{k}+b y_{k}\right)+2^{2 k-\ell-2}\left(a^{2}+b^{2}\right)
$$

Since $k \geq \ell+3$, the third term is congruent to 0 modulo $2^{k+1}$. Since $\nu_{2}\left(x_{k}\right)=\ell / 2$, the congruence

$$
a x_{k} 2^{k-\ell / 2} \equiv c-\left(x_{k}^{2}+y_{k}^{2}\right) \quad\left(\bmod 2^{k+1}\right)
$$

is solvable for $a$. Since $\nu_{2}\left(y_{k}\right)>\ell / 2$, taking $b=0$ gives a solution of

$$
\left(a x_{k}+b y_{k}\right) 2^{k-\ell / 2} \equiv c-\left(x_{k}^{2}+y_{k}^{2}\right) \quad\left(\bmod 2^{k+1}\right)
$$

and so $\left(x_{k+1}, y_{k+1}\right)=\left(x_{k}+a 2^{k-\ell / 2-1}, y_{k}\right)$ satisfies the required congruence. The identity $\nu_{2}\left(x_{k+1}\right)=\ell / 2$ follows from the inequality $\nu_{2}\left(a 2^{k-\ell / 2-1}\right) \geq k-\ell / 2-1 \geq$ $\ell / 2+2$. The corresponding condition on $y_{k+1}$ is obvious since $y_{k+1}=y_{k}$.

Next assume that $\ell$ is odd, and also assume, as part of the induction hypothesis, that $\nu_{2}\left(x_{k}\right)=\nu_{2}\left(y_{k}\right)=(\ell-1) / 2$. Expanding $\left(x_{k}+a 2^{k-(\ell+1) / 2}\right)^{2}+\left(y_{k}+\right.$ $\left.b 2^{k-(\ell+1) / 2}\right)^{2}$, we obtain

$$
\left(x_{k}^{2}+y_{k}^{2}\right)+2^{k+1-(\ell+1) / 2}\left(a x_{k}+b y_{k}\right)+2^{2 k-\ell-1}\left(a^{2}+b^{2}\right)
$$

Since $k \geq \ell+3$, the third term, as before, is congruent to 0 modulo $2^{k+1}$. Since $\nu_{2}\left(x_{k}\right)=\nu_{2}\left(y_{k}\right)=(\ell-1) / 2$, we have

$$
\nu_{2}\left(x_{k} 2^{k+1-(\ell+1) / 2}\right)=\nu_{2}\left(y_{k}^{k+1-(\ell+1) / 2}\right)=k,
$$

and so the congruence

$$
\left(a x_{k}+b y_{k}\right) 2^{k+1-(\ell+1) / 2} \equiv c-\left(x_{k}^{2}+y_{k}^{2}\right) \quad\left(\bmod 2^{k+1}\right)
$$

is solvable for $a$ and $b$. We take $\left(x_{k+1}, y_{k+1}\right)=\left(x_{k}+a 2^{k-(\ell+1) / 2}, y_{k}+b 2^{k-(\ell+1) / 2}\right)$. Since $\nu_{2}\left(a 2^{k-(\ell+1) / 2}\right), \nu_{2}\left(b 2^{k-(\ell+1) / 2}\right) \geq k-(\ell+1) / 2>(\ell-1) / 2$, we have $\nu_{2}\left(x_{k+1}\right), \nu_{2}\left(y_{k+1}\right)=(\ell-1) / 2$.

This provides the following description of the 2-adic completion of $E$ :
Corollary 3. The set $E$ is 2-adically dense in $\bigcup_{\ell \geq 0}\left(2^{\ell}+2^{\ell+2} \mathbb{Z}\right)$.
The 2-adic valuative capacity of $E$ can now be computed.
Proposition 6. The valuative capacity of $E$ for the prime 2 is given by

$$
L_{E, 2}=\frac{-1+\sqrt{13}}{2}
$$

Proof. Let $\bar{E}$ denote the 2-adic closure of $E$ determined in the previous corollary. Since

$$
\bar{E}=\bigcup_{\ell \geq 0}\left(2^{\ell}+2^{\ell+2} \mathbb{Z}\right)=(1+4 \mathbb{Z}) \cup 2\left(\bigcup_{\ell \geq 0}\left(2^{\ell}+2^{\ell+2} \mathbb{Z}\right)\right)=(1+4 \mathbb{Z}) \cup 2 \bar{E}
$$

we have

$$
L_{E, 2}=L_{\bar{E}, 2}=\frac{1}{\frac{1}{L_{1+4 \mathbb{Z}, 2}}+\frac{1}{L_{\bar{E}, 2}+1}}=\frac{1}{\frac{1}{3}+\frac{1}{L_{\bar{E}, 2}+1}}=\frac{1}{\frac{1}{3}+\frac{1}{L_{E, 2}+1}}
$$

which simplifies to

$$
L_{E, 2}^{2}+L_{E, 2}-3=0
$$

this has positive root as stated.

## 3. Valuative Capacity of the Set of Sums of Three Squares

Legendre's description of $F$ is equivalent to:
Proposition 7. The set $F$ can be expressed as

$$
F=\mathbb{Z} \backslash\left(\bigcup_{a \geq 0}\left(2^{2 a} 7+2^{2 a+3} \mathbb{Z}\right)\right)
$$

From this the valuative capacity of $F$ for odd primes is immediate:
Proposition 8. For any odd prime, $p$, the valuative capacity of $F$ with respect to $p$ is

$$
L_{F, p}=L_{\mathbb{Z}, p}=\frac{1}{p-1}
$$

Proof. From Proposition 7 it is clear that $F$ contains the coset $2+4 \mathbb{Z}$. If $c$ is a given integer and $k>0$, then the congruences

$$
\begin{aligned}
& z \equiv 2 \quad(\bmod 4) \\
& z \equiv c \quad\left(\bmod p^{k}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

are simultaneously solvable, hence have a solution in $F$. Thus $F /\left(p^{k}\right)=\mathbb{Z} /\left(p^{k}\right)$, and so $F$ is $p$-adically dense in $\mathbb{Z}$ and $L_{F, p}$ is as stated.

It thus only remains to determine $L_{F, p}$ for $p=2$.
Lemma 6. The set $F$ satisfies the equation

$$
F=(2+4 \mathbb{Z}) \cup(\{1,3,5\}+8 \mathbb{Z}) \cup 2^{2} F
$$

Proof. This is another restatement of Legendre's theorem, this time as a union of cosets:

$$
\begin{aligned}
F= & \left(\bigcup_{a \geq 0}\left(2^{2 a+1}+2^{2 a+2} \mathbb{Z}\right)\right) \cup\left(\bigcup_{a \geq 0}\left(\{1,3,5\} 2^{2 a}+2^{2 a+3} \mathbb{Z}\right)\right) \\
= & (2+4 \mathbb{Z}) \cup\left(\bigcup_{a \geq 1}\left(2^{2 a+1}+2^{2 a+2} \mathbb{Z}\right)\right) \\
& \cup(\{1,3,5\}+8 \mathbb{Z}) \cup\left(\bigcup_{a \geq 1}\left(\{1,3,5\} 2^{2 a}+2^{2 a+3} \mathbb{Z}\right)\right) \\
= & (2+4 \mathbb{Z}) \cup(\{1,3,5\}+8 \mathbb{Z}) \\
& \cup 2^{2}\left(\bigcup_{a \geq 0}\left(2^{2 a+1}+2^{2 a+2} \mathbb{Z}\right)\right) \cup\left(\bigcup_{a \geq 0}\left(\{1,3,5\} 2^{2 a}+2^{2 a+3} \mathbb{Z}\right)\right) \\
= & (2+4 \mathbb{Z}) \cup(\{1,3,5\}+8 \mathbb{Z}) \cup 2^{2} F
\end{aligned}
$$

as claimed.

By applying Proposition 3 twice to the result of Lemma 6, we obtain:
Lemma 7. The valuative capacity of $F$ with respect to the prime 2 satisfies the equation

$$
L_{F, 2}=\frac{1}{\frac{1}{L_{\{1,3,5\}+8 \mathbb{Z}, 2}}+\frac{1}{1+\frac{1}{\frac{1}{L_{2+4 \mathbb{Z}, 2}-1}+\frac{1}{L_{F, 2}+1}}}} .
$$

Two further applications evaluate the first term in the denominator on the right.
Lemma 8. The valuative capacity of $\{1,3,5\}+8 \mathbb{Z}$ is given by

$$
L_{\{1,3,5\}+8 \mathbb{Z}, 2}=\frac{11}{5}
$$

Proof. Expressing $\{1,3,5\}+8 \mathbb{Z}$ as $(\{1,5\}+8 \mathbb{Z}) \cup(3+8 \mathbb{Z})$, we obtain

$$
L_{\{1,5\}+8 \mathbb{Z}, 2}=2+\frac{1}{\frac{1}{L_{1+8 \mathbb{Z}, 2}-2}+\frac{1}{L_{5+8 \mathbb{Z}, 2}-2}}=2+\frac{1}{\frac{1}{4-2}+\frac{1}{4-2}}=3
$$

and

$$
\begin{aligned}
L_{\{1,3,5\}+8 \mathbb{Z}, 2} & =1+\frac{1}{\frac{1}{L_{\{1,5\}+8 \mathbb{Z}, 2}-1}+\frac{1}{L_{3+8 \mathbb{Z}, 2}-1}} \\
& =1+\frac{1}{\frac{1}{3-1}+\frac{1}{4-1}}=\frac{11}{5} .
\end{aligned}
$$

We thus have

$$
L_{F, 2}=\frac{1}{\frac{5}{11}+\frac{1}{1+\frac{1}{\frac{1}{3-1}+\frac{1}{L_{F, 2}+1}}}}
$$

which simplifies to give the quadratic

$$
26 L_{F, 2}^{2}+25 L_{F, 2}-55=0
$$

with positive root

$$
L_{F, 2}=\frac{-25+3 \sqrt{705}}{52}
$$

this concludes the proof of Theorem 3.

## References

[1] M. Bhargava, The factorial function and generalizations, Amer. Math. Monthly 107 (2000), 783-799.
[2] P.-J. Cahen and J.-L. Chabert, Integer-Valued Polynomials, Amer. Math. Soc., Providence, R.I., 1997.
[3] Y. Fares and K. Johnson, The characteristic sequence and $p$-orderings of the set of $d$-th powers of integer, Integers 12 (2012), Article \#A25.
[4] K. Johnson, P-orderings of finite subsets of Dedekind domains, J. Algebraic Combinatorics 30 (2009), 233-253.
[5] K. Johnson, Limits of characteristic sequences of integer-valued polynomials on homogeneous sets, J. Number Theory 129 (2009), 2933-2942.

