

# Covariance information based on the $t$ prior

Saralees Nadarajah and Samuel Kotz

**Abstract.** The exact distribution of the covariance between two populations is derived. It is assumed that one of the population means has a Student's  $t$  prior while the other is taken to come from one of normal, Student's  $t$ , Laplace, logistic or Bessel families (the five well-known symmetric distributions). The exact distribution is given in terms of the characteristic function. The calculations involve several special functions.

**Keywords:** characteristic function, covariance, Student's  $t$  distribution.

**Mathematical subject classification:** 33C90, 62E99.

## 1 Introduction

Suppose we have two observations  $x$  and  $y$  arising from two populations with means  $\mu_1$  and  $\mu_2$ , respectively. We are interested in studying the dependence between  $x$  and  $y$ . The most obvious measure is the covariance  $(x - \mu_1)(y - \mu_2)$ . Usually, the population means will be unknown but one might have some prior knowledge about them. For the past 40 to 50 years, the Student's  $t$  distribution has been the most popular prior distribution because elicitation of prior information in various physical, engineering, and financial phenomena is closely associated with that distribution. The Student's  $t$  distribution offers a more viable alternative to the normal distribution with respect to real-world data particularly because its tails are more realistic. Thus, we shall assume that  $\mu_1 \sim f(\mu_1 - x)$  and that  $\mu_2 \sim g(\mu_2 - y)$  independently of  $\mu_1$ , where  $f(\cdot)$  and  $g(\cdot)$  are Student's  $t$  pdfs with degrees of freedom  $v$  and  $b$ , respectively. The aim of this note is to derive the exact distribution of  $(x - \mu_1)(y - \mu_2)$  under these assumptions. This amounts to deriving the exact distribution of the product  $XY$  when  $X$  and  $Y$  are independent random variables with the pdfs  $f(\cdot)$  and  $g(\cdot)$ , respectively.

For completeness, in addition to the case that  $f$  and  $g$  are Student's  $t$  pdfs (considered in Section 3), we shall consider the four other cases:  $f$  is a Student's

$t$  pdf and  $g$  is a normal pdf (considered in Section 2);  $f$  is a Student's  $t$  pdf and  $g$  is a Laplace pdf (considered in Section 4);  $f$  is a Student's  $t$  pdf and  $g$  is a logistic pdf (considered in Section 5); and,  $f$  is a Student's  $t$  pdf and  $g$  is a Bessel pdf (considered in Section 6). For each of these cases, the exact distribution of  $XY$  is obtained by deriving its characteristic function (cf), which can be expressed as

$$\begin{aligned}\phi(t) &= E[\exp(itXY)] \\ &= \frac{1}{\sqrt{\nu}B(\nu/2, 1/2)} \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \exp(itxy) \left(1 + \frac{x^2}{\nu}\right)^{-(1+\nu)/2} g(y) dx dy.\end{aligned}\quad (1)$$

The calculations involve several special functions, including the  ${}_1F_1$  hypergeometric function (also known as the confluent hypergeometric function) defined by

$${}_1F_1(a; b; x) = \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{(a)_k}{(b)_k} \frac{x^k}{k!},$$

the Kummer function defined by

$$\begin{aligned}\Psi(a, b; x) &= \frac{\Gamma(1-b) {}_1F_1(a; b; x)}{\Gamma(1+a-b)} \\ &\quad + \frac{\Gamma(b-1)x^{1-b}}{\Gamma(a)} {}_1F_1(1+a-b; 2-b; x),\end{aligned}$$

the  ${}_1F_2$  hypergeometric function defined by

$${}_1F_2(a; b, c; x) = \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{(a)_k}{(b)_k(c)_k} \frac{x^k}{k!},$$

the  ${}_2F_1$  hypergeometric function (also known as the Gauss hypergeometric function) defined by

$${}_2F_1(a, b; c; x) = \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{(a)_k(b)_k}{(c)_k} \frac{x^k}{k!},$$

and the modified Bessel function of the third kind defined by

$$K_v(x) = \frac{\sqrt{\pi}x^v}{2^v \Gamma(v+1/2)} \int_1^{\infty} (t^2 - 1)^{v-1/2} \exp(-xt) dt,$$

where  $(e)_k = e(e+1)\cdots(e+k-1)$  denotes the ascending factorial. We also need the following important lemmas.

**Lemma 1.** (Equation (2.3.6.9), Prudnikov et al., 1986, volume 1). For  $\alpha > 0$  and  $p > 0$ ,

$$\int_0^\infty \frac{x^{\alpha-1} \exp(-px)}{(x+z)^\rho} dx = \Gamma(\alpha) z^{\alpha-p} \Psi(\alpha, \alpha+1-\rho; pz).$$

**Lemma 2.** (Equation (2.5.6.4), Prudnikov et al., 1986, volume 1). For  $b > 0$ ,  $\rho > 0$  and  $z > 0$ ,

$$\int_0^\infty \frac{\cos(bx)}{(x^2 + z^2)^\rho} dx = \left(\frac{2z}{b}\right)^{1/2-\rho} \frac{\sqrt{\pi}}{\Gamma(\rho)} K_{1/2-\rho}(bz).$$

**Lemma 3.** (Equation (2.3.8.4), Prudnikov et al., 1986, volume 1). For  $y > 0$  and  $z > 0$ ,

$$\int_0^\infty \frac{\exp(i\lambda x)}{(x^2 + z^2) (y \pm ix)} dx = \frac{\pi}{2} \exp(\pm \lambda z) (y \pm z)^{-1}.$$

**Lemma 4.** (Equation (2.16.3.13), Prudnikov et al., 1986, volume 2). For  $c > 0$ ,  $z > 0$  and  $\alpha > |\nu|$ ,

$$\begin{aligned} & \int_0^\infty \frac{x^{\alpha-1}}{(x^2 + z^2)^\rho} K_\nu(cx) dx \\ &= 2^{\nu-2} c^{-\nu} z^{\alpha-2\rho-\nu} \Gamma(\nu) B\left(\rho + \frac{\nu - \alpha}{2}, \frac{\alpha - \nu}{2}\right) \\ & \quad \times {}_2F_1\left(\frac{\alpha - \nu}{2}; 1 - \nu, 1 - \rho + \frac{\alpha - \nu}{2}; -\frac{c^2 z^2}{4}\right) \\ & \quad + 2^{-(\nu+2)} c^\nu z^{\alpha-2\rho+\nu} \Gamma(-\nu) B\left(\rho - \frac{\nu + \alpha}{2}, \frac{\alpha + \nu}{2}\right) \\ & \quad \times {}_2F_1\left(\frac{\alpha + \nu}{2}; 1 + \nu, 1 - \rho + \frac{\alpha + \nu}{2}; -\frac{c^2 z^2}{4}\right) \\ & \quad + 2^{\alpha-2\rho-2} c^{2\rho-\alpha} \Gamma\left(\frac{\alpha + \nu}{2} - \rho\right) \Gamma\left(\frac{\alpha - \nu}{2} - \rho\right) \\ & \quad \times {}_2F_1\left(\rho; 1 + \rho - \frac{\alpha + \nu}{2}, 1 + \rho - \frac{\alpha - \nu}{2}; -\frac{c^2 z^2}{4}\right). \end{aligned}$$

**Lemma 5.** (Equation (2.16.33.1), Prudnikov et al., 1986, volume 2). For  $b + c > 0$  and  $\alpha > |\mu| + |\nu|$ ,

$$\begin{aligned} & \int_0^\infty x^{\alpha-1} K_\mu(bx) K_\nu(cx) dx \\ &= \frac{2^{\alpha-3} b^\mu}{c^{\alpha+\mu} \Gamma(\alpha)} \Gamma\left(\frac{\alpha+\mu+\nu}{2}\right) \Gamma\left(\frac{\alpha+\mu-\nu}{2}\right) \Gamma\left(\frac{\alpha-\mu+\nu}{2}\right) \\ & \quad \times \Gamma\left(\frac{\alpha-\mu-\nu}{2}\right) {}_1F_2\left(\frac{\alpha+\mu+\nu}{2}, \frac{\alpha-\mu+\nu}{2}; \alpha; 1 - \frac{b^2}{c^2}\right). \end{aligned}$$

Further properties of the above special functions can be found in Prudnikov et al. (1986) and Gradshteyn and Ryzhik (2000).

## 2 Normal $g$

If  $g$  is the normal pdf given by

$$g(y) = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}\sigma} \exp\left\{-\frac{(y-\mu)^2}{2\sigma^2}\right\}$$

then (1) can be reduced as

$$\begin{aligned} \phi(t) &= \frac{1}{\sqrt{\nu}B(\nu/2, 1/2)} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}\sigma} \int_{-\infty}^\infty \int_{-\infty}^\infty \left(1 + \frac{x^2}{\nu}\right)^{-(1+\nu)/2} \\ & \quad \times \exp\left\{itxy - \frac{(y-\mu)^2}{2\sigma^2}\right\} dy dx \\ &= \frac{1}{\sqrt{\nu}B(\nu/2, 1/2)} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}\sigma} \int_{-\infty}^\infty \int_{-\infty}^\infty \left(1 + \frac{x^2}{\nu}\right)^{-(1+\nu)/2} \\ & \quad \times \exp\left\{\frac{2\sigma^2 itxy - y^2 + 2\mu y - \mu^2}{2\sigma^2}\right\} dy dx \\ &= \frac{1}{\sqrt{\nu}B(\nu/2, 1/2)} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}\sigma} \int_{-\infty}^\infty \int_{-\infty}^\infty \left(1 + \frac{x^2}{\nu}\right)^{-(1+\nu)/2} \\ & \quad \times \exp\left\{-\frac{(y-\mu-\sigma^2 itx)^2}{2\sigma^2} + \mu itx - \frac{\sigma^2 t^2 x^2}{2}\right\} dy dx \tag{2} \\ &= \frac{1}{\sqrt{\nu}B(\nu/2, 1/2)} \int_{-\infty}^\infty \left(1 + \frac{x^2}{\nu}\right)^{-(1+\nu)/2} \exp\left(\mu itx - \frac{\sigma^2 t^2 x^2}{2}\right) dx \\ &= \frac{2}{\sqrt{\nu}B(\nu/2, 1/2)} \int_0^\infty \left(1 + \frac{x^2}{\nu}\right)^{-(1+\nu)/2} \cos(\mu tx) \exp\left(-\frac{\sigma^2 t^2 x^2}{2}\right) dx. \end{aligned}$$

The integral in (2) cannot be calculated directly in its general form. However, using the series expansion for cosine

$$\cos(x) = \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{(-1)^k x^{2k}}{(2k)!}, \quad (3)$$

one can rewrite (2) as

$$\begin{aligned} \phi(t) &= \frac{2}{\sqrt{\nu} B(\nu/2, 1/2)} \int_0^\infty \left(1 + \frac{x^2}{\nu}\right)^{-(1+\nu)/2} \left\{ \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{(-1)^k (\mu t x)^{2k}}{(2k)!} \right\} \\ &\quad \times \exp\left(-\frac{\sigma^2 t^2 x^2}{2}\right) dx \\ &= \frac{2\nu^{\nu/2}}{B(\nu/2, 1/2)} \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{(-1)^k (\mu t)^{2k}}{(2k)!} \int_0^\infty x^{2k} \left(\nu + x^2\right)^{-(1+\nu)/2} \\ &\quad \times \exp\left(-\frac{\sigma^2 t^2 x^2}{2}\right) dx \\ &= \frac{\nu^{\nu/2}}{B(\nu/2, 1/2)} \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{(-1)^k (\mu t)^{2k}}{(2k)!} \int_0^\infty w^{k-1/2} (\nu + w)^{-(1+\nu)/2} \\ &\quad \times \exp\left(-\frac{\sigma^2 t^2 w}{2}\right) dw, \end{aligned} \quad (4)$$

where the last step follows by the substitution  $w = x^2$ . The integral in (4) can be calculated by direct application of Lemma 1 to yield

$$\begin{aligned} \phi(t) &= \frac{1}{B(\nu/2, 1/2)} \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{(-1)^k \nu^k (\mu t)^{2k}}{(2k)!} \Gamma\left(k + \frac{1}{2}\right) \\ &\quad \Psi\left(k + \frac{1}{2}, k - \frac{\nu}{2} + 1; \frac{\sigma^2 t^2 \nu}{2}\right), \end{aligned} \quad (5)$$

an infinite sum involving the Kummer function. If  $\mu = 0$  then (5) reduces to the simple form

$$\phi(t) = \frac{\Gamma((\nu + 1)/2)}{\Gamma(\nu/2)} \Psi\left(\frac{1}{2}, \frac{2-\nu}{2}; \frac{\sigma^2 t^2 \nu}{2}\right). \quad (6)$$

If  $\mu = 0$  and  $\nu = 1$  then (6) can be reduced further to

$$\phi(t) = \exp\left(\frac{\sigma^2 t^2}{2}\right) \operatorname{erfc}\left(\frac{\sigma |t|}{\sqrt{2}}\right).$$

### 3 Student's $t$ $g$

Suppose  $g$  is the Student's  $t$  pdf with degrees of freedom  $b$  given by

$$g(y) = \frac{1}{\sqrt{b}B(b/2, 1/2)} \left(1 + \frac{y^2}{b}\right)^{-(1+b)/2}. \quad (7)$$

Note that (1) can be expressed as

$$\begin{aligned} \phi(t) &= \frac{1}{\sqrt{\nu}B(\nu/2, 1/2)} \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \exp(itxy) \left(1 + \frac{x^2}{\nu}\right)^{-(1+\nu)/2} g(y) dx dy \\ &= \frac{4\nu^{\nu/2}}{B(\nu/2, 1/2)} \int_0^{\infty} \int_0^{\infty} \cos(tx y) \left(1 + \frac{x^2}{\nu}\right)^{-(1+\nu)/2} g(y) dx dy. \end{aligned} \quad (8)$$

The inner integral in (8) can be calculated by direct application of Lemma 2. This yields

$$\phi(t) = \frac{2^{2-\nu/2} \nu^{\nu/4} t^{\nu/2}}{\Gamma(\nu/2)} \int_0^{\infty} y^{\nu/2} K_{-\nu/2}(t\sqrt{\nu}y) g(y) dy. \quad (9)$$

For the form of  $g(\cdot)$  given by (7), direct application of Lemma 4 shows that (9) can be calculated as

$$\begin{aligned} \phi(t) &= \frac{2^{2-\nu/2} \nu^{\nu/4} b^{b/2} t^{\nu/2}}{\Gamma(\nu/2) B(b/2, 1/2)} \int_0^{\infty} y^{\nu/2} K_{-\nu/2}(t\sqrt{\nu}y) (y^2 + b)^{-(1+b)/2} dy \\ &= \frac{2^{-\nu/2} \nu^{\nu/4} b^{b/2} t^{\nu/2}}{\Gamma(\nu/2) B(b/2, 1/2)} \left[ 2^{-\nu/2} (t\sqrt{\nu})^{\nu/2} (\sqrt{b})^{\nu-b} \right. \\ &\quad \times \Gamma\left(-\frac{\nu}{2}\right) B\left(\frac{b-\nu}{2}, \frac{\nu+1}{2}\right) \\ &\quad \times {}_2F_1\left(\frac{\nu+1}{2}; 1+\frac{\nu}{2}, 1+\frac{\nu-b}{2}; -\frac{t^2\nu b}{4}\right) \\ &\quad + 2^{\nu/2} (t\sqrt{\nu})^{-\nu/2} (\sqrt{b})^{-b} \Gamma\left(\frac{\nu}{2}\right) B\left(\frac{b}{2}, \frac{1}{2}\right) \\ &\quad \times {}_2F_1\left(\frac{1}{2}; 1-\frac{\nu}{2}, 1-\frac{b}{2}; -\frac{t^2\nu b}{4}\right) \\ &\quad \left. + 2^{\nu/2-b-2} (t\sqrt{\nu})^{b-\nu/2} \Gamma\left(-\frac{b}{2}\right) \Gamma\left(\frac{a-b}{2}\right) \right. \\ &\quad \left. \times {}_2F_1\left(\frac{1+b}{2}; 1+\frac{b}{2}, 1+\frac{b-\nu}{2}; -\frac{t^2\nu b}{4}\right) \right]. \end{aligned} \quad (10)$$

#### 4 Laplace $g$

If  $g$  is the Laplace pdf given by

$$g(y) = \frac{\lambda}{2} \exp(-\lambda |y - \theta|)$$

then (1) can be reduced as

$$\begin{aligned} \phi(t) &= \frac{\lambda v^{\nu/2}}{2B(\nu/2, 1/2)} \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \exp\{itxy - \lambda |x - \theta|\} (y^2 + \nu)^{-(1+\nu)/2} dx dy \\ &= \frac{\lambda v^{\nu/2}}{2B(\nu/2, 1/2)} \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} (y^2 + \nu)^{-(1+\nu)/2} \left[ \int_{-\infty}^{\theta} \exp\{-\lambda(\theta - x) + itxy\} dx \right. \\ &\quad \left. + \int_{\theta}^{\infty} \exp\{-\lambda(x - \theta) + itxy\} dx \right] dy \\ &= \frac{\lambda v^{\nu/2}}{2B(\nu/2, 1/2)} \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} (y^2 + \nu)^{-(1+\nu)/2} \left[ \frac{\exp(it\theta y)}{\lambda + ity} + \frac{\exp(it\theta y)}{\lambda - ity} \right] dy. \end{aligned} \quad (11)$$

The integral in (11) cannot be calculated in its general form. However, in the particular case  $\nu = 1$ , one can reduce (11) as

$$\begin{aligned} \phi(t) &= \frac{\lambda}{2\pi} \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} (y^2 + 1)^{-1} \left[ \frac{\exp(it\theta y)}{\lambda + ity} + \frac{\exp(it\theta y)}{\lambda - ity} \right] dy \\ &= \frac{\lambda}{2\pi t} \left[ \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \frac{\exp(it\theta y)}{(y^2 + 1)(\lambda/t + iy)} dy + \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \frac{\exp(it\theta y)}{(y^2 + 1)(\lambda/t - iy)} dy \right] \\ &= \frac{\lambda}{2} \left[ \frac{\exp(t\theta)}{\lambda + t} + \frac{\exp(-t\theta)}{\lambda - t} \right], \end{aligned} \quad (12)$$

where the last step follows by direct application of Lemma 3.

#### 5 Logistic $g$

Suppose  $g$  is the logistic pdf given by

$$g(y) = \frac{\lambda \exp\{-\lambda(y - \theta)\}}{\left[1 + \exp\{-\lambda(y - \theta)\}\right]^2}.$$

Note that this can be reexpressed as the mixture of Laplace pdfs:

$$g(y) = \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{2}{k+1} \binom{-2}{k} \frac{\lambda(k+1)}{2} \exp\{-\lambda(k+1) |y - \theta|\}.$$

Thus, using the result for the Laplace distribution given by (12), one obtains

$$\phi(t) = \lambda \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \binom{-2}{k} \left[ \frac{\exp(t\theta)}{(k+1)\lambda + t} + \frac{\exp(-t\theta)}{(k+1)\lambda - t} \right] \quad (13)$$

for the particular case  $\nu = 1$ .

## 6 Bessel $g$

Suppose  $g$  is the Bessel function pdf given by

$$g(y) = \frac{|y|^m}{\sqrt{\pi} 2^m b^{m+1} \Gamma(m+1/2)} K_m \left( \left| \frac{y}{b} \right| \right).$$

For this form, (9) can be expressed as

$$\begin{aligned} \phi(t) &= \frac{2^{2-\nu/2} \nu^{\nu/4} t^{\nu/2}}{\sqrt{\pi} 2^m b^{m+1} \Gamma(\nu/2) \Gamma(m+1/2)} \\ &\times \int_0^\infty y^{\nu/2+m} K_{-\nu/2}(t\sqrt{\nu}y) K_m(y/b) dy. \end{aligned}$$

An application of Lemma 5 shows that the above can be reduced to

$$\begin{aligned} \phi(t) &= \frac{\Gamma((\nu+1)/2) \Gamma(m+(\nu+1)/2)}{b^{m+1} \Gamma(\nu/2) \Gamma(\nu/2+m+1)} \\ &\times {}_1F_2 \left( m + \frac{1}{2}, m + \frac{\nu+1}{2}; \frac{\nu}{2} + m + 1; 1 - t^2 \nu b^2 \right). \end{aligned} \quad (14)$$

Using special properties of the Gauss hypergeometric function, one can reduce (14) to elementary forms when  $m$  and  $\nu$  take integer or half-integer values. For example, if  $\nu = 1$  and  $m = 2, 3, 4, 5, 6$  then (14) can be reduced to the simple forms

$$\phi(t) = \frac{16}{15\pi} \left\{ \frac{25x-15}{8x^2(x-1)^2} + \frac{15 \operatorname{arctanh}(\sqrt{x})}{8x^{5/2}} \right\},$$

$$\phi(t) = \frac{32}{35\pi} \left\{ \frac{-231x^2 + 280x - 105}{48x^3(x-1)^3} - \frac{35 \operatorname{arctanh}(\sqrt{x})}{16x^{7/2}} \right\},$$

$$\phi(t) = \frac{256}{315\pi} \left\{ \frac{837x^3 - 1533x^2 + 1155x - 315}{128x^4(x-1)^4} + \frac{315 \operatorname{arctanh}(\sqrt{x})}{128x^{9/2}} \right\},$$

$$\begin{aligned}\phi(t) &= \frac{512}{693\pi} \left\{ \frac{-10615x^4 + 26070x^3 - 29568x^2 + 16170x - 3465}{1280(x-1)^5 x^5} - \frac{693 \operatorname{arctanh}(\sqrt{x})}{256x^{11/2}} \right\}, \\ \phi(t) &= \frac{2048}{3003\pi} \left\{ \frac{154635x^5 - 476905x^4 + 723294x^3 - 594594x^2 + 255255x - 45045}{15360x^6(x-1)^6} \right. \\ &\quad \left. + \frac{3003 \operatorname{arctanh}(\sqrt{x})}{1024x^{13/2}} \right\},\end{aligned}$$

where  $x = 1 - t^2 b^2$ . Also, if  $\nu = 1$  and  $m = 3/2, 5/2, 7/2, 9/2, 11/2$  then (14) reduces to

$$\begin{aligned}\phi(t) &= \frac{1}{x^2} + \frac{(12x - 8)\sqrt{1-x}}{8x^2(-1+x)^2}, \\ \phi(t) &= -\frac{1}{x^3} + \frac{(-30x^2 + 40x - 16)\sqrt{1-x}}{16x^3(-1+x)^3}, \\ \phi(t) &= \frac{1}{x^4} + \frac{(280x^3 - 560x^2 + 448x - 128)\sqrt{1-x}}{128x^4(x-1)^4}, \\ \phi(t) &= -\frac{1}{x^5} + \frac{(-630x^4 + 1680x^3 - 2016x^2 + 1152x - 256)\sqrt{1-x}}{256x^5(x-1)^5}, \\ \phi(t) &= \frac{1}{x^6} + \frac{(2772x^5 - 9240x^4 + 14784x^3 - 12672x^2 + 5632x - 1024)\sqrt{1-x}}{1024x^6(x-1)^6},\end{aligned}$$

where  $x = 1 - t^2 b^2$ .

## References

- [1] I.S. Gradshteyn and I.M. Ryzhik. *Table of Integrals, Series and Products* (sixth edition). San Diego: Academic Press (2000).
- [2] A.P. Prudnikov, Y.A. Brychkov and O.I. Marichev. *Integrals and Series* (volumes 1, 2 and 3). Amsterdam: Gordon and Breach Science Publishers (1986).

**Saralees Nadarajah**  
School of Mathematics  
University of Manchester  
Manchester M60 1QD  
UNITED KINGDOM

E-mail: [saralees.nadarajah@manchester.ac.uk](mailto:saralees.nadarajah@manchester.ac.uk)

**Samuel Kotz**  
Department of Engineering Management and  
Systems Engineering  
The George Washington University  
Washington, D.C. 20052  
U.S.A.

E-mail: [kotz@seas.gwu.edu](mailto:kotz@seas.gwu.edu)